Status of PN and EOB calculations in modified theories of gravity

Laura Bernard

"Connecting the dots" workshop

AEI, Potsdam - June 14-16 2023



Starting point: GR

Gravitational wave modelling



Credits: M. van de Meent

▷ Synergies with *scattering amplitudes*

Starting point: general relativity

$$R^{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2} g^{\mu\nu} R = 8\pi T^{\mu\nu}$$

 \triangleright Defining $h^{\mu\nu} = \sqrt{-g} g^{\mu\nu} - \eta^{\mu\nu}$, we rewrite it as

$$\Box_{\eta} h^{\mu\nu} = 16\pi \left| g \right| T^{\mu\nu} + \underbrace{\Lambda^{\mu\nu}}_{\propto h\partial^2 h + \partial h\partial h + \dots} \equiv \tau^{\mu\nu}$$

Matter field equations

 \triangleright harmonic gauge $\partial_{\nu} h^{\mu\nu} = 0 \iff$ geodesic equation $\nabla_{\nu} T^{\mu\nu} = 0$



The basics of the PN formalism

$$h^{\mu\nu}(\mathbf{x},t) = \frac{16\pi G}{c^4} \left(\Box_{\text{ret}}^{-1} \tau^{\mu\nu} \right) (\mathbf{x},t)$$

Flat-space retarded propagator

$$\left(\Box_{\rm ret}^{-1}\tau\right)(\mathbf{x},t) \equiv -\frac{1}{4\pi} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \frac{\mathrm{d}^3 \mathbf{x}'}{|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'|} \tau\left(\mathbf{x}', t - \frac{|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'|}{c}\right)$$

 \triangleright near zone: ill-behaved when $r \gg \lambda_{\text{GW}}$:

$$\bar{h}^{\mu\nu} = \sum_{m=2}^{\infty} \frac{1}{c^m} \bar{h}^{\mu\nu}_m, \text{ with } \begin{cases} \Box \bar{h}^{\mu\nu}_m = 16\pi G \,\bar{\tau}^{\mu\nu}_m \text{ and } \tau^{\mu\nu} = \underbrace{T^{\mu\nu}}_{\text{source}} + \underbrace{\Lambda^{\mu\nu}}_{\text{nonlinearities}} \\ \partial_{\nu} \bar{h}^{\mu\nu}_m = 0 \end{cases}$$

 \triangleright wave zone: ill-behaved when $r \rightarrow 0$:

$$h_{\text{ext}}^{\alpha\beta} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} G^n h_{(n)}^{\alpha\beta}, \text{ with } \begin{cases} \Box h_{(n)}^{\alpha\beta} = \Lambda_n^{\alpha\beta} \left[h_{(1)}, ..., h_{(n-1)} \right] \\ \partial_\beta h_{(n)}^{\alpha\beta} = 0 \end{cases}$$

The multipolar PM - PN algorithm



State-of-the-art in GR - dynamics

	Dynamics							
PN order	non-spinning	spinning			tides			
		SO	SS	higher spins				
0	\checkmark	-	-	-	-			
1	\checkmark	-	-	-	-			
1.5	-	\checkmark	-	-	-			
2	\checkmark	-		-	-			
2.5	\checkmark	\checkmark	-	-	-			
3	\checkmark	-		-	-			
3.5	\checkmark	\checkmark	-	$\sqrt{(S^3)}$	-			
4	\checkmark	-		$\sqrt{(S^4)}$	-			
4.5	*		-	$\sqrt{(S^3)}$	-			
5	*	-		$\sqrt{(S^4)}$	\checkmark			
5.5	*			$\sqrt{(S^5)}$	-			
6				$\sqrt{(S^6)}$	$\sqrt{(7\text{PN})}$			

State-of-the-art in GR - flux and GW modes

	Dissipative flux					
PN order	non-spinning	spinning				
		SO	SS	higher spins		
2.5	\checkmark	-	-	-		
3	-	-	-	-		
3.5		-	-	-		
4	\checkmark		-	-		
4.5	\checkmark	-	\checkmark	-		
5	\checkmark	\checkmark	-	-		
5.5		\checkmark	\checkmark	-		
6	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	$\sqrt{(S^3)}$		
6.5	*		\checkmark			
7						

- $\triangleright~$ Tidal effects at 2.5PN beyond leading order
- $\triangleright~$ Small eccentricity at 4PN

Going beyond GR

Generalised Brans-Dicke theory

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[\mathcal{G}(\phi) R - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_a \varphi \nabla^a \varphi - \mathcal{V}(\varphi) \right] + S_m[\psi_m; g]$$

$$S_{\rm ST} = \frac{c^3}{16\pi G} \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[R - \frac{1}{2} g^{\alpha\beta} \partial_\alpha \varphi \,\partial_\beta \varphi \right] + S_m \left[\mathfrak{m}, A(\varphi) \,g_{\alpha\beta} \right]$$

Field equations in Einstein frame

$$\begin{cases} \Box h^{\mu\nu} = 16\pi G \,\bar{\tau}_m^{\mu\nu} \text{ with } \tau^{\mu\nu} = \underbrace{T^{\mu\nu}}_{\text{source}} + \underbrace{\Lambda^{\mu\nu}}_{\nabla h \cdot \nabla h} + \underbrace{\Lambda^{\mu\nu}}_{\nabla \varphi \cdot \nabla \varphi} \\ \Box \varphi = 16\pi G \,\bar{\tau}_{\text{s}} \text{ with } \tau_{\text{s}} = \underbrace{T_{\text{S}}}_{\text{source}} + \underbrace{\Sigma_{\text{S}}}_{\sim h\partial^2 \varphi + \partial h\partial \varphi + \nabla \varphi \cdot \nabla \varphi} \end{cases}$$

- $\triangleright~{\rm PN}$ expansion for $\varphi~\sim~h^{00}$
- $\triangleright\,$ no hair theorem but scalarized neutron stars
- \triangleright a good starting point for more complicated theories
 - Einstein-scalar-Gauss-Bonnet, Einstein-Maxwell-dilaton

Coupling to matter

Skeletonization [Eardley '75]

• Incorporate the internal structure of compact, self-gravitating bodies

$$S_{\rm m} = -c \sum_A \int \mathrm{d} au_A \, m_A(arphi)$$

$$\triangleright \text{ Sensitivities: } s_A = \left. \frac{\mathrm{d} \ln m_A(\varphi)}{\mathrm{d} \ln \varphi} \right|_0 + \text{higher orders}$$

o related to the scalar charge α_A ∝ 1 − 2s_A
o no hair theorem for BHs: s_A = 0.5 (⇐⇒ α_A = 0)

Coupling to matter

Skeletonization [Eardley '75]

• Incorporate the internal structure of compact, self-gravitating bodies

$$S_{\rm m} = -c \sum_A \int \mathrm{d} au_A \, m_A(arphi)$$

$$\triangleright \text{ Sensitivities: } s_A = \left. \frac{\mathrm{d} \ln m_A(\varphi)}{\mathrm{d} \ln \varphi} \right|_0 + \text{ higher orders}$$

• related to the scalar charge $\alpha_A \propto 1 - 2s_A$

- no hair theorem for BHs: $s_A = 0.5 \iff \alpha_A = 0$
- ▷ Can be calcuated by matching to a known solution
 - NSs: depends on the equation of state $(s_A \sim 0.2)$
 - scalarized black holes in other theories (EMD, EsGB) [Julié 2017, Julié-Berti 2019]

The equations of motion



Differences w.r.t. GR

 \circ Dissipative effects start at 1.5PN (v.s. 2.5PN in GR)

[Mirshekari & Will 2013; LB 2018, 2019]

The equations of motion



Differences w.r.t. GR

- Dissipative effects start at 1.5PN (v.s. 2.5PN in GR)
- A conservative scalar tail term at 3PN : $\mathbf{A}_{3PN}^{\text{tail}} \propto \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \frac{\mathrm{d}t'}{|t-t'|} I_s {}^{(4)}_i(t')$

[Mirshekari & Will 2013; LB 2018, 2019]

The equations of motion



Differences w.r.t. GR

- Dissipative effects start at 1.5PN (v.s. 2.5PN in GR)
- A conservative scalar tail term at 3PN : $\mathbf{A}_{3PN}^{\text{tail}} \propto \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \frac{\mathrm{d}t'}{|t-t'|} I_s {}^{(4)}_i(t')$
- Tidal effects start at 3PN (v.s. 5PN in GR)

[Mirshekari & Will 2013; LB 2018, 2019]

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{F} &= \frac{32c^5\nu^2 x^5}{5G_{\text{eff}}} \bigg[1 + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1\text{PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^2} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1.5\text{PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^3} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{2\text{PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^4} \bigg] \\ &+ \frac{4c^5\nu^2 x^5}{3G_{\text{eff}}} \zeta S_-^2 \bigg[x^{-1} \\ &x \equiv \left(\frac{G_{\text{eff}} m\omega}{c^3}\right)^{2/3}, \ \nu \equiv \frac{m_1 m_2}{m^2} \end{split}$$

Differences w.r.t. GR

• Scalar flux starts at -1PN, known at 1.5PN: **2PN in progress**

[Lang 2013, LB, Blanchet, Trestini 2022, LB, Trestini in prep.]

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{F} &= \frac{32c^5\nu^2 x^5}{5G_{\text{eff}}} \bigg[1 + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1\text{PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^2} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1.\text{SPN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^3} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{2\text{PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^4} \bigg] \\ &+ \frac{4c^5\nu^2 x^5}{3G_{\text{eff}}} \, \zeta S_-^2 \bigg[x^{-1} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{0\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^0} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{0.\text{SPN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^1} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^2} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1.5\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^3} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{2\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^4} \bigg] \\ &x \equiv \left(\frac{G_{\text{eff}} m \omega}{c^3}\right)^{2/3}, \ \nu \equiv \frac{m_1 m_2}{m^2} \end{split}$$

Differences w.r.t. GR

- Scalar flux starts at -1PN, known at 1.5PN: **2PN in progress**
- Scalar tail term at 0.5PN: $\delta U_i^s \propto \frac{M}{c^3} \int d\tau \ln\left(\frac{\tau}{\tau_0}\right) I_s{}_i^{(3)}(t-\tau)$
- Scalar memory term at 1.5PN: $\delta U_{ij} \propto \frac{1}{c^3} \int \frac{dt'}{|t-t'|} I_s {}^{(2)}_i(t') I_s {}^{(2)}_j(t')$

[Lang 2013, LB, Blanchet, Trestini 2022, LB, Trestini in prep.]

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{F} &= \frac{32c^5\nu^2 x^5}{5G_{\text{eff}}} \bigg[1 + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{\text{1PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^2} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{\text{1.5PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^3} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{\text{2PN}}^{\text{grav}}}{c^4} \bigg] + \frac{4c^5\nu^2 x^4}{3G_{\text{eff}}} \zeta S_-^2 \cdot \frac{\mathcal{F}_{\text{2PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^4} \\ &+ \frac{4c^5\nu^2 x^5}{3G_{\text{eff}}} \zeta S_-^2 \bigg[x^{-1} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{0\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^0} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{0.5\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^1} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^2} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{1.5\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^3} + \frac{\mathcal{F}_{2\text{PN}}^{\text{scal}}}{c^4} \bigg] \\ &x \equiv \left(\frac{G_{\text{eff}} m\omega}{c^3}\right)^{2/3}, \ \nu \equiv \frac{m_1 m_2}{m^2} \end{split}$$

Differences w.r.t. GR

- Scalar flux starts at -1PN, known at 1.5PN: **2PN in progress**
- Scalar tail term at 0.5PN: $\delta U_i^s \propto \frac{M}{c^3} \int d\tau \ln\left(\frac{\tau}{\tau_0}\right) I_s{}_i^{(3)}(t-\tau)$
- Scalar memory term at 1.5PN: $\delta U_{ij} \propto \frac{1}{c^3} \int \frac{dt'}{|t-t'|} I_s {i \choose j} (t') I_s {j \choose j} (t')$
- Scalar tidal contribution at 2PN

[Lang 2013, LB, Blanchet, Trestini 2022, LB, Trestini in prep.]

Massive scalar field

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[R - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_a \varphi \nabla^a \varphi - V(\varphi) \right] + S_m[\psi_m; g]$$

▷ Yukawa decay
$$V_{\varphi} = [\dots] e^{-m_s r}$$
; flux $P_s^{(\text{dip})} \propto r^2 \Omega^4 \left(1 - \frac{m_s^2}{\Omega^2}\right)^{3/2}$

▷ 1PN results [Huang et al. 2018]

Tensor mutli-scalar gravity

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[R - \frac{1}{2} f_{ab} \nabla_\mu \varphi^a \nabla^\mu \varphi^b - V(\phi_c) \right] + S_m[\psi_m; g]$$

- ▷ 2PN dynamics and 1PN flux [Damour & Esposito-Farèse 1992, 1996]
- ▷ 2.5PN* dynamics (* no matter description) [Schön & Doneva 2022]

Complexifying: beyond BD-like ST theories

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[R - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_a \varphi \nabla^a \varphi - e^{-2a\varphi} F^{ab} F_{ab} \right] + S_m[\psi_m; g]$$

Skeletonization

$$S_{\rm m} = -c \sum_A \int \mathrm{d}\tau_A \, m_A(\varphi) + \sum_A q_A \int A_\mu \, \mathrm{d}x_A^\mu$$

▷ matching to known BH solutions *e.g.* $m_A(\varphi) = \sqrt{\mu_A^2 + q_A^2 \frac{e^{2\varphi}}{2}}$

 \triangleright Effective gravitational cst. to include electric charge $e_A \equiv \frac{q_A}{m_A} e^{a\varphi_0}$

- ▷ 1PN dynamics [Julié 2017]
- ▷ 1PN flux [Julié 2018; Khalil et al. 2018]

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[R - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_a \varphi \nabla^a \varphi + \alpha f(\varphi) \mathcal{G} \right] + S_m[\psi_m; g]$$

Some examples with hairy BH solutions

 \triangleright Einstein-scalar-Gauss-Bonnet

$$\mathcal{G} = R_{abcd} R^{abcd} - 4R_{ab} R^{ab} + R^2$$

▷ Chern-Simmons gravity (parity-violating)

$$\mathcal{G} = \frac{1}{2} \, \epsilon^{\rho \sigma \alpha \beta} \, R_{\nu \mu \rho \sigma} \, R^{\mu \nu}_{\ \alpha \beta}$$

Small coupling curvature corrections (EsGB)



- \triangleright change in effective parameters, *i.e.* G_{eff} , *etc.*
- only leading order(LO) correction in α needed to get the full 3PN
 o dimension-full coupling constant [α] = [length]²

$$\zeta = \frac{\alpha}{M^2}$$

• small $\alpha \ (\sim \frac{1}{c^4})$ approximation \longrightarrow 3PN correction

▷ LO dynamics and flux [Julié 2018, Julié & Berti 2019]

Adding specific effects

Response to an external scalar dipolar field



Response to an external scalar dipolar field



- \triangleright adiabatic approximation: $\mathcal{Q}^{(s)}_{\mu} = -\lambda_{(s)} \mathcal{E}^{(s)}_{\mu}$
- ▷ dimensionfull scalar tidal deformability: $\left[\frac{G\lambda_s}{c^2}\right] = [\text{length}]^3$
- ▷ formally 3PN order correction with small ST parameters (GR: 5PN)

In the action



$$S_{\rm m} = S_{\rm pp} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{A} \lambda_A^{(s)}(\phi) \int d\tau_A \, \left(g^{\mu\nu} \partial_\mu \phi \, \partial_\nu \phi\right)_A \, + \text{high. orders}$$

Consequence on the dynamics

$$\Delta \mathbf{a}_{(fs)} \propto \ \mathbf{a}_{(\mathrm{N})} \cdot \left[\frac{m_2}{m_1} \,\overline{\delta}_2 \, \lambda_1^{(s)} + \frac{m_1}{m_2} \,\overline{\delta}_1 \, \lambda_2^{(s)} \right] \frac{Gm}{c^2} \, \frac{1}{r^3}$$

In the action



$$S_{\rm m} = S_{\rm pp} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{A} \lambda_A^{(s)}(\phi) \int d\tau_A \, \left(g^{\mu\nu} \partial_\mu \phi \, \partial_\nu \phi\right)_A \, + \text{high. orders}$$

Consequence on the dynamics

$$\Delta \mathbf{a}_{(fs)} \propto \mathbf{a}_{(\mathrm{N})} \cdot \left[\frac{m_2}{m_1} \,\overline{\delta}_2 \, k_1^{(s)} + \frac{m_1}{m_2} \,\overline{\delta}_1 \, k_2^{(s)} \right] \frac{R^3}{r^3}$$

▷ dimensionless scalar Love number: $k_s \equiv \frac{G \lambda_s}{c^2 R^3} \longrightarrow 3 PN$

- LO dynamics and flux in ST theories [LB 2018] (NNLO [Dones, Mougiakakos & LB in prep.])
- \triangleright LO dynamics and flux in EsGB [van Gemeren et al. 2023]

Effective field theory description (as for GR)

$$S_{\text{mat}} = \int \mathrm{d}\tau_A \left[p_\mu u^\mu + \frac{1}{2} S_{\mu\nu} \Omega^{\mu\nu} + \frac{1}{m^2} \mathcal{C}_{\varphi}^* S_{\nu}^{\alpha} u^\nu \nabla_\mu \varphi \underbrace{-\frac{1}{6} J^{\gamma\nu\sigma\alpha} R_{\gamma\nu\sigma\alpha}}_{\text{quadrupole corr.}} \right]_A$$

 \triangleright obtained by doing $p_{\mu} \longrightarrow \mathcal{P}_{\mu}\left(u^{\mu}, \Omega^{\mu\nu}, g_{\mu\nu}, R_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}, \varphi, \partial\varphi, \ldots\right)$

 \triangleright modified spin supplementary condition $S^{\mu\nu}\mathcal{P}_{\nu}=0$

- ▷ LO (2PN) dynamics: SS, monopole-quadrupole, scalar-dipole [Loutrel et al. 2018]
- ▷ Corrections to the phase at 1.5PN (SO, SS) and 2PN (scalar dipole) [Loutrel et al. 2022]

- PN results can apply to already (adiabatically) scalarized objects
 scalar charges computed by matching to known solutions
- \triangleright dynamical scalarization
 - effective description: see Mohammed Khalil's talk

Towards full IMR waveforms: EOB

The basics of EOB



Credits: Buonanno & Sathyaprakash

 $\triangleright \text{ Canonical transformation: } (r, \phi, p_r, p_\phi) \longrightarrow (R, \Phi, P_R, P_\Phi)$ $H_{2\text{body}} \longrightarrow H_{\text{eff}} \longrightarrow H_{EOB} = M\sqrt{1 + 2\nu \left(H_{\text{eff}} - 1\right)}$

Current status



EOB Hamiltonian

- ▷ 2PN in simple ST theories [Julié 2017]
- \triangleright 3PN [Julié et al. 2022; Jain et al. 2022]
 - \triangleright includes non-local in time tail terms
 - $\triangleright\,$ extended to include LO contribution in EsGB

Conclusion

- $\triangleright\,$ Many recent progresses in the simplest theories
- $\triangleright\,$ Synergies with numerical relativity results: full IMR
- ▷ Important for the future: non-perturbative effects (scalarization), spins, tides
- ▷ Missing theories or too preliminary: Lorentz-violating, DHOST, massive gravity, *etc.*
- ▷ A natural question: is it really usefull even for next generation detectors?

▷ should we look only for striking signatures?